

# Plenary

---

Meeting date:  
**Wednesday, 2 May 2012**

Meeting time:  
**13:30**

Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales



## Votes and Proceedings

(61)

---

### 1. Questions to the Minister for Education & Skills

The item started at 13:30.

The first 12 questions were asked. Questions 6 and 10 were answered by the Deputy Minister for Skills.

### 2. Questions to the Minister Local Government & Communities

The item started at 14:16.

All 15 questions were asked.

### Urgent Question

The item started at 15:04.

**Andrew RT Davies (South Wales Central):** Further to the Minister's written statement today, and the news that 3 Local Health Boards have required additional financial assistance from the Welsh Government, will the Minister make an urgent statement on the implications for the NHS budget.

### 3. Motion to establish the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister

The item started at 15:11.

#### **NDM4969 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.5:

1. Establishes a Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister; and

2. Agrees that the remit of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister is to scrutinise the First Minister on any matter relevant to the exercise of the functions of the Welsh Government.

**The Motion was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.**

#### **4. Motion to elect Members to the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister**

The item started at 15:11.

##### **NDM4970 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:

1. Paul Davies (Conservatives), Mark Drakeford (Labour), Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru), David Melding (Conservatives) and Eluned Parrott (Liberal Democrats) as members of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister; and
2. David Melding (Conservatives) as Chair of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister.

**The Motion was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.**

#### **5. Debate on the Children & Young People Committee's report on Children's Oral Health**

The item started at 15:12.

##### **NDM4971 Christine Chapman (Cynon Valley)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Notes the report of the Children and Young People Committee on the inquiry into children's oral health, which was laid in the Table Office on 22 February 2012.

Note: The response by the Welsh Government was laid on 25 April 2012.

**The Motion was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.**

#### **6. Welsh Conservatives Debate**

The item started at 15:57.

**Voting on the motion and amendments under this item was deferred until Voting Time.**

A vote was taken on the motion without amendment:

##### **NDM4972 William Graham (South Wales East)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Notes:

- a) the benefits a council tax freeze would bring to the Welsh economy;
  - b) the £38.9m consequential from the UK Government as a result of funding for a council tax freeze in England;
  - c) the cost of a council tax freeze for the financial year 2012–13 would be significantly lower than £38.9m;
  - d) the benefits that could be realised with the remaining monies to help SMEs in Wales
2. Calls for full transparency, accountability and efficiency in public expenditure in Wales.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
10	0	36	46

The motion without amendment was not agreed.

The following amendments were tabled:

**Amendment 1 – Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)**

In point 1a delete ‘a council tax freeze’ and replace with ‘increased spending on infrastructure’

A vote was taken on Amendment 1:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
36	0	10	46

Amendment 1 was agreed.

**Amendment 2 – Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)**

In point 1 delete all after the first ‘in’ and replace with ‘England and believes this should be used to stimulate the Welsh economy, including helping SMEs in Wales.’

A vote was taken on Amendment 2:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
31	0	15	46

Amendment 2 was agreed.

**Amendment 3 – Peter Black (South Wales West)**

At the end of point 1b, add:

"and welcomes the economic stimulus package it was used to fund."

As amendment 2 was agreed, amendment 3 was deselected.

**Amendment 4 – Peter Black (South Wales West)**

Delete point 1c and 1d.

**As amendment 2 was agreed, amendment 4 was deselected.**

**Amendment 5 – Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)**

Insert at end of point 2: ‘including making better use of infrastructure spending’

A vote was taken on Amendment 5:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
46	0	0	46

**Amendment 5 was agreed.**

**Amendment 6 – Peter Black (South Wales West)**

Add as new point at end of motion:

Notes that 16 Conservative councils in England and one in Wales have failed to follow Conservative party policy and are increasing council tax this year.

A vote was taken on Amendment 6:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
29	0	17	46

**Amendment 6 was agreed.**

**Amendment 7 – Peter Black (South Wales West) – In accordance with Standing Order 12.23(iii), this amendment was not selected.**

Add as new point at end of motion:

Welcomes the careful financial management of Welsh Liberal Democrat-led local authorities which has enabled them to keep council tax rises low over the last eight years.

**A vote was taken on the motion as amended:**

**NDM4972 William Graham (South Wales East)**

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Notes:

a) the benefits increased spending on infrastructure would bring to the Welsh economy;

b) the £38.9m consequential from the UK Government as a result of funding for a council tax freeze in England and believes this should be used to stimulate the Welsh economy, including helping SMEs in Wales.

2. Calls for full transparency, accountability and efficiency in public expenditure in Wales including making better use of infrastructure spending.

3. Notes that 16 Conservative councils in England and one in Wales have failed to follow Conservative party policy and are increasing council tax this year.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
36	0	10	46

**The motion as amended was agreed.**

## **7. Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate**

The item started at 16:51.

**Voting on the motion and amendments under this item was deferred until Voting Time.**

A vote was taken on the motion without amendment:

### **NDM4973 Peter Black (South Wales West)**

To propose that the national Assembly for Wales:

Welcomes the careful financial management of Welsh Liberal Democrat-led local authorities which has enabled them to keep council tax rises low over the last eight years.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
5	0	41	46

**The motion without amendment was not agreed.**

**The following amendments were tabled:**

### **Amendment 1 – William Graham (South Wales East)**

Delete all and replace with

Encourages careful financial management on the part of all local authorities to enable them to implement a council tax freeze.

A vote was taken on Amendment 1:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
10	0	36	46

**Amendment 1 was not agreed.**

### **Amendment 2 – William Graham (South Wales East)**

Add new point.

Regrets the failure of the Welsh Government to pass on the £38.9 million consequential in order to ensure a Wales-wide council tax freeze.

A vote was taken on Amendment 2:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
10	0	36	46

Amendment 2 was not agreed.

As the Assembly did not agree the motion without amendment, and did not agree the amendments tabled to the motion, the motion was therefore not agreed.

### Voting Time

Voting Time started at 17:32.

### 8. Short Debate

The item started at 17:37.

#### **NDM4968 Mark Isherwood (North Wales): Hospice and Palliative Care in Wales**

Noting that as the population ages and people approach the end of life with ever more complex care needs, facilitating access to cost effective, high quality palliative and end of life care will become ever more important.

The meeting concluded at 17:59.

**The Assembly will sit again in Plenary at 13:30, Tuesday, 8 May 2012**